AN EXAMPLE OF CROSS BORDER COLLABORATION WITH MIGRANT WOMEN

TEXAS PUBLIC HEALTH ASSOCIATION ANNUAL EDUCATION CONFERENCE
VIVA PUBLIC HEALTH

BORDER PUBLIC HEALTH SESSION

Dr. Eva M. Moya
Dr. Silvia M. Chavez Baray
Daniel Salvadoray
Patricia O. Carrete

March, 2013

Photo by Laura Acosta
OUR PARTNERS

Centro Comunitario Presidio Dolores in San Elizario
Programa Compañeros in Ciudad Juárez
Casa Amiga in Ciudad Juárez
Fiscalía del Estado en Chihuahua

*Sponsored by the College of Health Sciences CAP² Project: Voices & Images of Migrant Women Domestic Violence, Sexual and Reproductive Health  [UTEP IRB 336186-1]*

*Translation by the Department of Languages and Linguistics at UTEP*
Goal and Aims

Goal:
Increase awareness of the impact of domestic violence on sexual and reproductive health on Mexican migrant women.

Aim:
1. Train 16 community partners and academic scholars on the use of the Photovoice method.
2. Recruit and train 22 migrant women to identify culturally-specific elements of domestic violence, sexual and reproductive health through Photovoice.
3. Provide rich qualitative data describing the effects of domestic violence on sexual, and reproductive health on migrant women in the border region.
4. Support and mobilize migrant women to present their perspectives on sexual and reproductive health to policy and decision makers.
5. Conduct formative research to inform services, policy and education efforts on domestic violence, sexual and reproductive health.
Photovoice Defined

➢ Photovoice involves community people taking pictures of their own health realities followed by small group conscious-raising discussions and presentations to decision makers.

➢ Photovoice method was initially developed by Drs. Caroline Wang and Mary Ann Burris [www.photovoice.com](http://www.photovoice.com)
Photovoice Steps

1. Form an Advisory Committee

2. Recruit participants (e.g., inclusion criteria)

3. Conduct participant orientation and ethics training

4. Have participants take photos

5. Convene participant meetings to discuss photos

6. Repeat steps 4-5 several times

7. Prepare presentations to decision makers
Photovoice

- Enables people to record and reflect upon their personal and community strengths and challenges.
- Promotes critical dialogue and knowledge about personal and community issues through group discussion of photographs.
- Reaches decision and policy makers to create positive change in partnership with communities.
Theory

• Empowerment and Critical Thinking
  – Participants identify, discuss, and address historical, institutional, political, and social conditions that contribute to personal and community problems (Freire, 1970; Hall & Stevens, 1991; Feminist writers)

• Feminist Theory
  – Each individual has a specific history, a particular experience configured by class, race, gender, sexuality, family, country, dislocation, and alliance. These histories are mediated through the types of representation available in the culture

• Approaches to documentary photography
SHOWeD Questions

➢ What do you See here?

➢ What is really Happening here?

➢ How does this relate to Our lives?

➢ Why does this situation, concern, or strength exist?

➢ What can we Do to improve the situation, or to enhance these strengths?
1. Training of Trainers (ToT)…
## 2. Recruitment and Training of Women… Their Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agency Partners</th>
<th>Diocesan Migrant &amp; Refugee Services</th>
<th>Familias Triunfadoras</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of Participants</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Origin, Social Status</td>
<td>Mexican Migrants</td>
<td>Mexican Migrants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic Violence</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age Range (average)</td>
<td>16-50 years (38)</td>
<td>19-72 years (45.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*Education (average)</td>
<td>9-20 years (14.6)</td>
<td>6-17 years (11.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Insurance (type)</td>
<td>1 (private plan)</td>
<td>2 (Medicaid)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>*Occupation</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*Domestic Work</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Service Industry</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professional</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*Unemployed</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>*Promotoras (volunteer)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## 2. Recruitment and Training of Women... Community Group Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community Site</th>
<th>College of Health Sciences</th>
<th>Presidio Dolores Center</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number of Sessions, Frequency (duration)</strong></td>
<td>5 weekly (3-4 hours each)</td>
<td>4 weekly (3 hours each)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Characterization</strong></td>
<td>Entrepreneurs</td>
<td>Volunteer health <em>Promotoras</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Violence (Past or Current)</strong></td>
<td>Intimate Partner Violence – free (at time of study)</td>
<td>Some evidence of current/on-going domestic violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Therapeutic Support</strong></td>
<td>Participating in psycho-educational interventions</td>
<td>Community oriented</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. To provide rich qualitative data through Photovoice....

Manifestations of Domestic Violence
“These are my legs. When I was physically abused, I went through a lot of pain. I have lived a serious and traumatizing experience of domestic violence that I don't wish on anyone. To me, this was dramatic and disturbing; I lived all this in front of my children. It made me feel powerless to look at them scared and feel I couldn't help them. Let's raise our voices and don’t let ourselves be abused!”

Anonymous
“Physical and emotional abuse affects everything in our lives. In my sister, it (abuse) affected her nerves, she now has facial paralysis. We need to help women so that they recognize when they're being abused so they can escape and don't allow be crushing and humiliating. Leaving the fear behind, reporting the aggressor, seeking shelter and protection is vital. The Violence Against Women Act grants protection to women so they can get on with their life. Without economic independence they may not have enough money and may end up in the streets. I also lived in domestic violence.”

María
Impacts on Sexual and Reproductive Health
“When I cover myself with my hands and say "no more", it is because I don’t want to be forced to have sex without being respected and loved. I am learning how to say no. By being submitted to the violence of our culture and our partner, we are not exercising our right to demand when we want to have sex. It is important to recognize where our sensuality ends and abuse starts. Let’s learn to say when and how we want to have sex!”

Berenice
“Many women aren't happy, they live with fear and are afraid to say they have a Sexually Transmitted Disease (STD) such as HIV/AIDS for the risk to be pointed at or discriminated. We need more education to stop the discrimination against other people.”

Elsa
Recommendations to Improve Sexual and Reproductive Health Services
“Sometimes we see free information and we do not take it into account, we ignore it, because we say that it will not happen to us. Ignorance, fear, taboos and the shame will not save us from sexually transmitted diseases or unwanted pregnancies, no matter our age and background. Having access to information and education that is easy to understand as well as having other women and man like promotoras(es). I learned through the years that we must not blind ourselves to violence and abuse because of ignorance or the fear to know.”

María and Alejandra
BREAKING THE CYCLE OF VIOLENCE

"These are children living in a place for families victims of domestic violence. When I watch them play, I can see they adopt the role of victims or aggressors, since a very young age. They are in a vicious circle. Let’s break the cycle putting an end to violence at home.”

Martha
4. To support and mobilize migrant women...

Call to Action to Improve Women’s Health

*Violence against women has no geographic, cultural or social borders*

To prevent and address Violence against Women and improve Sexual and Reproductive Health in this community:

- Increase the **visibility** of people affected by violence, their stories, lives, worries, concerns, vulnerabilities and aspirations.
- Work for **equality**. For gender equality, women must live free of violence; equality will be achieved when violence and threats are eliminated from their lives.
- **Raise awareness** about violence against women and their sexual and reproductive health to authorities, lawmakers, opinion leaders, and the community in general.
- Include **prevention and attention** to violence in every work setting to increase the level of knowledge on its impacts against women, their health, and their children. Violence against women puts women and their children at risk of suffering different types of emotional and physical health problems.
- More and better **strategies in those services** needed and/or used by women.
- Sustainable and permanent **funding** for services and interventions for women, girls, and aggressors through mechanisms effective for that community.
- **Timely and quality access** to sexual and reproductive health through life. Use of a Women’s Health Card.
- **Education** as a tool for women’s **empowerment**
Project Milestones

• Evidence of participant empowerment, increased self-confidence, successful referrals to health, legal and social services, re-enrollment in school (GED, ESL, EPCC & UTEP) (6/2012-Present)
• Establishment of a Community Academic Engaged Advisory Committee (6/2012)
• 2012 International Women’s Health Summit Maya Angelou Center. North Carolina - Project presentation (9/27)
• 1st Mano y Corazon Conference. El Paso – Project presentation (10/2)
• Inauguration of XII Binational Health Week. Oaxaca – Panel presentation (10/2)
• Closure of XII Binational Health Week. El Paso – Gallery Opening (10/15)
• Gallery presentation at UTEP CHSN (10/22-11/3)
• Presentation of Gallery to Dr. Natalicio HSNB by project participants (10/31)
• Ongoing project media coverage (i.e., UNIVISION, UTEP, Communications, AZTECA, KFOX, Chicago National (CAN), Diarios de Juarez and El Paso, and El Paso Times)
• Production of 11 minute project documentary by MSW Graduate student (Silvadoray)
• Submission of a project continuation proposal to the Hispanic Health Research Disparities Center.
• Project manuscript in development.
ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Heidi Renpenning, UNIVISION
Omar Martinez, JD, Columbia University
Dr. Hector Ocaranza, City of El Paso Department of Public Health
Lic. Berenice Córdoba, Consulado General de México
Guadalupe Perez-Gavilan ,Consulado General de México
Dr. William Wood, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee
Dean Kathleen Curtis, PhD, College of Health Sciences
Stephanie Karr, Center Against Family Violence
Karina Zazueta, Indiana University Law School
Maria Covernali, Familias Triunfadoras, Inc.
Frank Desales, Familias Triunfadoras, Inc
Carliene Quist, UTEP MSW Program
Dr. Irasema Coronado, Political Science UTEP
Irma G. Casas Franco, Casa Amiga AC
Dr. Michael Kelly, Paso del Norte Health Foundation
Daniel Silvadoray, UTEP MSW Program
The Consulate General of Mexico in El Paso, Texas cordially invites you to the closing ceremony of the XII Binational Health Week.

**Save the date**
October 15, 2012 / 1-6 pm
UTEP College of Health Sciences and School of Nursing - Room 217

"Salud primero es amor. Health first is love."

**Program**

**UTEP College of Health Sciences and School of Nursing**
* 1:00 pm - Registration
* 1:30 pm - Ceremony
* 2:00 pm - Panel: Challenges and Opportunities in U.S. - Mexico Border Health

**Centennial Museum and Chihuahuan Desert Garden**
* 4:00 pm - Opening of the exhibition "Voices and Images: Migrant Women, Sexual and Reproductive Health and Domestic Violence"
* 4:30 pm - Tour of the exhibition "Nuestra Casa"
* 5:00 pm - Reception

---

**UTEP College of Health Sciences**
1851 Wiggins Rd.
El Paso, TX 79968

**Centennial Museum**
500 West University Avenue
El Paso, TX 79968
4. To support and mobilize migrant women to present...
Inauguration of Voices and Images Gallery
UTEP Centennial Museum - October 15, 2012

Hon. Jacob Prado
Consulate General of Mexico

Dr. Kathleen Curtis
College of Health

Mr. Candido Morales
IME

Dr. Gudelia Rangel
Mexico Secretary of Health

Dr. Jill McDonald
USDHHS USMBHC
Meeting with Dr. Natalicio and Project Participants
Other Photovoice Project Impacts

Results from the Training of Trainers

• Adaptation of Photovoice by Center for Accommodations and Support Services for the 1st Disability Awareness Week

• ToT of facilitators and establishment of 5 groups with personnel of the Fiscalía del Gobierno del Estado de Chihuahua Atención a Víctimas (Crime Victims)
Next Steps

• 2\textsuperscript{nd} Gallery exhibit at the Mexican Consulate in El Paso (Nov.15-Dec. 22)
• Spring 2012 Gallery presentations in the San Elizario School District
• Explore strategic presentations in Austin, Washington DC, Ciudad Juárez, Baja California and Mexico City.
• Publication of the project in peer-review journals.
Project Acknowledgment

María, Vargas, Belia, Imelda, Alejandra, Rosa, Maribel, María, Mónica, Luisa, Karla, Elsa, Lucia, Norma, Berenice, Martha, Lourdes, Mayra, Yudith, Sofía and participants that prefer to remain anonymous.

Thank you for your participation, insight and strength. The milestones you accomplished are the result of your choice to change the cycles, the personal and family histories and to advocate for the social wellbeing. Thank you for your kindness.
Thank you

For more information

Dr. Eva M. Moya
emmoya@utep.edu
(915) 747-8493

Dr. Silvia M. Chávez Baray
smchavezbaray@utep.edu
(915) 747-7009
MEDIA COVERAGE

**UTEP NEWSLETTER.** Junio 5, 2012
[http://universitycommunications.utep.edu/newsletter/06.05.12/newsletter.html](http://universitycommunications.utep.edu/newsletter/06.05.12/newsletter.html)

**CANAL UNIVISION**
PRIMERA. Julio 18, 2012

SEGUNDA. Agosto 1, 2012
Programa de la Frontera (30 minutos)

TERCERA. Agosto 22, 2012

TOARTA. Septiembre 2, 2012

**EL DIARIO DE EL PASO, TX.**
Septiembre 2, 2012

Septiembre 3, 2012
[http://www.diario.com.mx/notas.php?f=2012/09/03&id=c448c8b01b8aeb95874de39a9f4b0fef](http://www.diario.com.mx/notas.php?f=2012/09/03&id=c448c8b01b8aeb95874de39a9f4b0fef)

**OTROS MEDIOS**


MEDIA COVERAGE

XII SEMANA BINACIONAL DE SALUD. OCTUBRE 2 DEL 2012
http://www.semanabinacionalmexico.org/panelistas/esp/
http://hia.berkeley.edu/index.php?page=binational-policy-forum

CONFERENCIA DE PRENSA. MUJER DESPIERTA. OCTUBRE 18 DEL 2012
CAN TV
http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Q7ThjCDZYCE
UNIVISION

UTEP MAGAZINE. WINTER 2013
http://utepmagazine.utep.edu/